Ecotoxicological effects of typical pollutants on algae in aquatic environment: a review

Weihua Zhao^{a,b,†}, Liangyuan Zhao^{a,b,†}, Xianqiang Tang^{a,b,*}, Weijie Guo^{a,b}, Qingyun Li^{a,b}, Zhuo Huang^{a,b}, Dandan Gong^{a,b}

^aBasin Water Environmental Research Department, Changjiang River Scientific Research Institute, Wuhan, China, Tel. +86-27-8292-6192; email: ckyshj@126.com (X. Tang), Tel. +86-27-8292-7263; emails: zwh820305zwh@163.com (W. Zhao); zhaoliangyuannew@163.com (L. Zhao); guoweijie1986@163.com (W. Guo); 285986314@qq.com.com (D. Gong), Tel. +86-27-8282-9818; email: liqy@mail.crsri.cn (Q. Li), Tel. +86-27-8292-6591; email: huangzhuo03@hotmail.com (Z. Huang) ^bHubei Provincial Key Laboratory of River Basin Water Resources and Eco-environmental Sciences, Changjiang River Scientific Research Institute, Wuhan, China

Received 12 April 2018; Accepted 3 August 2018

ABSTRACT

The ecotoxicological effects of heavy metals, organic compounds, and artificial nanomaterials on algae growth were reviewed in the this paper, from which we conclude that the pollutants had stimulating effects on the growth of algae within the low concentration range, and the number of algal cells increased in the short term. This phenomenon occurred during early exposure to the low concentration group and in the middle and late stages of exposure to the medium concentration group. However, algae growth was highly inhibited, and the algal cells were stressed in the high concentration group. Toxic mechanisms of pollutants on algae were explained through the influencing perspectives of enzyme activity, photosynthesis, cell structure, and metabolism of algae. The present review will be certain to provide guidance for the biological evaluation of water pollution.

Keywords: Algae; Heavy metals; Organic compounds; Artificial nanomaterials; Ecological toxicology

1. Introduction

With the rapid development of industry and technology, various pollutants continue to enter into the water bodies, thereby participating in the biochemical cycle of water and affecting the eco-environmental security of water. Research regarding the harmful effect of pollutants on aquatic ecosystems, the physiological and ecological responses of aquatic organisms to pollutants was usually used to indicate the degree of water pollution [1].

Algae are the primary producers in aquatic ecosystems and play a key role in material cycles and energy flow [2]. There has been a rapid growth of pollution of aquatic environment, mostly from anthropogenic sources, and chief sources of the aquatic pollution are either direct dumping of industrial effluents or spills or indirect, via leaching or runoff [3]. The pollutants that enter into water via various channels are first to have an impact on the primary producers. Therefore, algae are often used as a crucial indicator for monitoring changes of water environments. In addition, due to the characteristics of small individuals for the algae, that is rapid reproduction and sensitivity to poison, the impacts of the tested substances on the generation and populations of such individuals can be determined in a short period, and

^{*} Corresponding author.

⁺ The first two authors contributed equally to this work.

Presented at the 3rd International Conference on Recent Advancements in Chemical, Environmental and Energy Engineering, 15–16 February, Chennai, India, 2018.

^{1944-3994/1944-3986 © 2018} Desalination Publications. All rights reserved.

the poisoning situation at the cellular level can be directly observed [4]. Therefore, ecotoxicology research of algae has received increasing attention [5].

To date, the main pollutants used in the research of algal ecotoxicology are heavy metals or organic compounds. Related studies mainly focused on the damage of toxicants to algae in water bodies and its effect on different levels of life, such as cells, organs, individuals, populations, and communities [4,6]. However, as the progress in science and technology, increasingly more nanomaterials are entering into water environments. Because of their special physical and chemical properties, these materials pose a threat to the ecological environment and human health. Therefore, the harmful effect of heavy metals, organic compounds, and nanomaterials on algae from the perspective of algae growth, enzyme activity, photosynthesis, cell structure, and metabolism was summarized to provide guidance for the biological evaluation of water pollution.

2. Ecotoxicological effects of heavy metals

2.1. Single heavy metals

Algae growth requires not only macroelements such as C, H, O, N, P, S, K, Ca, and Mg, but also microelements such as Cu, Fe, and Mn. However, excessive heavy metals have harmful effect on the growth of algae. Low concentrations of heavy metals promoted the growth of algae, whereas high concentrations inhibited algae growth [7].

2.1.1. Effective concentration of heavy metals on algae

The half maximal effective concentration (EC₅₀) was determined by the algal growth inhibition test to confirm the harmful effect of heavy metals on algae. Among the previous ecotoxicology experiment regarding Cyanophyta, Chlorophyta, Bacillariophyta, Chrysophyta, and Pyrrophyta, Chlorophyta was the frequently used test species in large part. The heavy metals used are mainly Cu, Cr, Cd, Zn, Pb, and Mn. For Cu, *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* in Bacillariophyta is the most sensitive type of algae, and *Phormidium* sp. in Cyanophyta has the strongest tolerance. For Cd, *Anabaena flos-aquae* in Cyanophyta is the most sensitive alga, and *Karenia mikimotoi* in Pyrrophyta was the most tolerant. The EC₅₀ of various types of algae subject to single heavy metal stress is summarized in Table 1.

2.1.2. Influence of heavy metals on algae photosynthesis

Different algae under heavy metal stress yield different accumulation patterns of heavy metals, which affect the biosynthesis of photosynthetic pigments to different degrees [30]. Accumulated heavy metals in plants interact with the photosynthetic mechanisms and produce a series of toxic effects such as photo-oxidation injuries. In particular, heavy metals alter the function of chloroplast membrane and affect the formation of the components of optoelectronic transport chains, which in turn affect the photoreaction stage in photosynthesis [31]. Experiments have shown that treating *Scenedesmus obliquus* with a high concentration of copper ions (Cu²⁺, 20–100 μ mol/L) restrains its photosynthesis, hinders the electron transport of photosystem II (PSII), and inhibits the photosynthetic rate and light use efficiency. However, the results were no significant with a low concentration of Cu^{2+} [31]. Nevertheless, the effects of some heavy metals on photosynthesis were determined by affecting the membrane permeability, interfering with the distribution of ions, and inhibiting the enzyme activity [32]. Excessive Cu^{2+} hindered the formation and stability of chlorophyll by forming coordination compounds, thereby reducing the content of chlorophyll [32,33]. Nevertheless, the effects of some heavy metals on photosynthesis were reflected in disturbing the membrane permeability, interfering with the distribution of ions, and inhibiting the enzyme activity [34].

2.1.3. Influence of heavy metals on algae enzyme activity

Generally, heavy metals have two mechanisms that affect enzyme activity: one is the hampering of the absorption and utilization of metal ions as cofactors of enzymes by heavy metals, and the other is the forming of chelates by the combination of heavy metals and enzyme proteins, resulting in changes in the structure and configuration of the enzyme, which influence enzyme activity [35]. Experiments have shown that a low concentration of cadmium ions (Cd²⁺) promotes the activity of peroxidase (POD) in Microcystis aeruginosa, whereas a high concentration of Cd²⁺ has a strong toxic effect on the same substance. In one experiment, algae cells were severely damaged and protein synthesis decreased, which reduced the activity of the antioxidant enzyme system. With an increase in the concentration of Cd²⁺, the activity of catalase (CAT) in M. aeruginosa and S. obliquus cells presented a trend of initially rising then falling, both peaking when the concentration of Cd²⁺ was 0.15 mg/L, which was significantly different from that of the control group [36,37]. Studies on the toxic effects of Cd²⁺ on Selenastrum capricornutum have concluded that the activity of deoxyribonuclease, dehydrogenases, and POD is strongly affected by an increase in Cd²⁺ concentration within the nonlethal concentration range (0.25-1.5 mg/L CdCl₂). Meanwhile, cell division, the photosynthetic oxygen release rate, and cell membrane permeability were strongly inhibited [38].

2.1.4. Influence of heavy metals on the cell structure and metabolism of algae

Elevated concentration of Cu²⁺ could inhibit the growth and reproduction of algae, possibly because the permeability of the protoplasmic membrane was affected and the potassium was lost from the cell [39]. The metabolism of various compounds in normal algae cells would be affected to some extent and even some metabolic processes could be interrupted [39]. When copper ions surpass the toxic level, the structure of algal cells is damaged. Exposed to a high concentration of Cu²⁺, Chlorella and Scenedesmus cells were deformed into those containing coarse particles. When transferred to a medium without ${\rm \widetilde{C}}u^{\scriptscriptstyle 2+}\!\!\!\!$, the large cells divided and were restored to their original morphology [40]. In addition, Cu²⁺ caused Chlorella and Ankistrodesmus sp. to form into giant cells and Anacystis nidulansso to become spherical, and thus completely different from its regular shape [40]. The ultrastructures of the chloroplasts, mitochondria, and cell nuclei of

Table 1 $\mathrm{EC}_{\mathrm{50}}$ of various heavy metals on algae

Algae species		Heavy metal	EC_{50} (mg/L)			References
			48h-EC ₅₀	72h-EC ₅₀	96h-EC ₅₀	
Bacillariophyta	Phaeodactylum	Cd ²⁺			0.120	[8]
	tricornutum	Cu ²⁺		0.531 ± 0.037	0.017	[6,8]
		Zn^{2+}			0.363	[8]
		Pb ²⁺			0.468	[8]
	Nitzschia sp.	Cr ⁶⁺		0.260		[9]
	Nitzschia closte- rium	Cr ⁶⁺		0.278		[10]
	Skeletonema costatum	Cu ²⁺		0.546 ± 0.068		[6]
	Chaetoceros	Cu ²⁺		0.326		[11]
	muelleri	Cd ²⁺		0.386		[11]
Chrysophyta	Dicrateria sp.	Sn ⁴⁺		0.00058-0.00077		[12]
je j	Isochrysis galbana	Cu ²⁺	0.555		1.881	[13]
	Jeeen yee guttin	Cd ²⁺	0.986		6.268	[13]
		Zn ²⁺	5 209		18 732	[13]
	Isochrusis zhan-	Ph ²⁺	0.207		9.030	[14]
	<i>jianggenesi</i> s sp. nov	10			7.000	[11]
	Isochrysis galbana			8.830		[14]
	Monochrysis	Cd ²⁺		75		[15]
	lutheri	Cu ²⁺		15		[15]
	Pavlova viridis	Cd ²⁺			7.777	[16]
					1.469	[17]
		Cu ²⁺			1.192	[16,17]
					7.079	[17]
		Zn ²⁺			3.548	[16]
					25.700	[17]
		Pb ²⁺			33.010	[16]
Cyanophyta	Anabaena flos- aauae	Cd ²⁺			0.0135	[18]
	, Microcystis aeru- ginosa	Cu ²⁺			0.083	[19]
	Plectonema radiosum	Cu ²⁺			318	[20]
	Phormidium sp.	Cu ²⁺			339	[20]
	Spirulina plat-	Pb ²⁺		11.46		[21]
	ensis	Cr ⁶⁺			11.74	[22]
	Synechococcus	Cr ⁶⁺			6.5	[22]
	sp. Svirulina maxima	Cr ⁶⁺			11.16	[22]
Pyrrophyta	Karenia mikimo-	C11 ²⁺	1.866		6.268	[14.23]
- <i>j</i> op <i>j</i>	toi	Cd ²⁺	5 405		13.134	[14.23]
		Zn ²⁺	13 134		18.732	[14.23]
	Prorocentrum	C11 ²⁺	0 514		1 125	[14 23]
	т тогосститит титтит	Cd ²⁺	0.835		4 376	[14 23]
		Zn^{2+}	4 376		7 976	[14 23]
			1.070		1.970	[17,40]

(Continued)

Table 1 (Continued)

Algae species		Heavy metal	EC ₅₀ (mg/L)			References
			48h-EC ₅₀	72h-EC ₅₀	96h-EC ₅₀	
Chlorophyta	Chlorella autotro- phica	La ³⁺			4.055	[24]
	Chlorella ellip-	Cu ²⁺		1.452		[25]
	soidea	Zn^{2+}		61.988		[25]
		Ni ²⁺		6.908		[25]
		Cd ²⁺		10.512		[25]
	Chlorella	Cu ²⁺			0.067	[10,25]
	pyrenoidosa	Zn^{2+}			0.473	[10]
		Mn ²⁺			0.017	[10]
		Cr ⁶⁺			4.96	[22]
	Chlorella sp.	Pb ²⁺			>20	[14]
		Cd ²⁺		26.992		[26]
		Cu ²⁺	1.11	18.496	0.77	[26,27]
		Zn^{2+}	1.1	20.020	0.85	[26,27]
		Hg ²⁺	0.002		0.005	[26,27]
	Closterium lunula	Cu ²⁺			0.200	[10]
					0.202	[28]
		Zn^{2+}			0.038	[10]
		Mn ²⁺			0.013	[10]
	Platymonas	Cu ²⁺	1.041		0.671	[13]
	helgolandica var.	Zn^{2+}	23.274		5.773	[13]
	tsingtaoensis	Cd ²⁺	16.25		1.188	[13]
	Tetraselmis	Cd ²⁺		53.436		[26]
	tetrethele	Cu ²⁺		13.504		[26]
		Zn^{2+}		49.010		[26]
	Platymonas sub-	Cd ²⁺		300		[11]
	cordifomis	Cu ²⁺		1.703		[11]
	Selenastrum capricornutum	Cr ⁶⁺			12.43	[22]
	Scenedesmus quadricauda	Cr ⁶⁺			20.89	[22]
	Scenedesmus	Cu ²⁺	0.029		0.050	[29]
	obliquus	Zn ²⁺	0.230		0.567	[29]
		Pb ²⁺	0.122		0.759	[29]
		Mn ²⁺	20.95		29.22	[29]

Platymonas subcordiformis were destroyed to varying degrees after Cu²⁺ poisoning, and the pyrenoids disintegrated [41]. Cd²⁺ caused the outer layer of *Selenastrum minutum* cells to become detached. The chloroplast volume decreased, and the structure was changed to the appearance of a large vacuole with the enlargement of inclusion particles in cells [45]. After Ni²⁺ caused toxicity to *Ankistrodesmus*, the cytoderm thickened and deformed, evident plasmolysis appeared in the cytoplasm, and the laminated structure of the thylakoid was destroyed [42].

2.2. Coexistent heavy metals

Many heavy metal elements coexist in natural water. Algae are often affected by combinations of various heavy metals that influence their growth and reproduction and ultimately affect their physiological and biochemical functions. The combinations of heavy metals can be divided into four types: antagonism, synergism, addition, and sensitization [43]. Liu [29] indicated that when the heavy metal ions of Cu²⁺, Zn²⁺, Pb²⁺, and Mn²⁺ were pairwise combined, the toxic effect of their combination was different, embodied as synergistic or antagonistic. Regarding pairs of metals, different combinations yielded different effects. The effects of single combinations might also change over time [29]. The interactions between Cr^{2+} , Ni^{2+} , and Pd^{2+} on *Nostoc muscorum* were investigated, and the effects of the combinations of $Cr^{2+} + Ni^{2+}$ and $Cr^{2+} + Pb^{2+}$ on the growth of algae were antagonistic. However, the antagonistic effect of $Cr^{2+} + Ni^{2+}$ was maintained only for 72 h and was followed by a synergistic effect. The effects of combining Ni^{2+} and Pb^{2+} were not considerably different from the individual effects of Ni^{2+} and Pb^{2+} [44]

3. Ecotoxicological effects of organic compounds on algae

3.1. Effective concentration of organic compounds on algae

Organic compounds such as phenolic compounds, pesticides, plasticizers, and surfactants have toxical impacts on algae. The plasticizer dibutyl phthalate (DBP) had highly harmful effect on *S. obliquus*, with a 96h-EC₅₀ of 0.021 mg/L. The resistance of *S. obliquus* to phenol was strong, with a 96h-EC₅₀ of 341 mg/L. *Chlorella* sp. was highly tolerant of lambda-cyhalothrin, with a 96h-EC₅₀ of 105.71 mg/L (Table 2).

3.2. Influence of organic compounds on the photosynthesis of algae

Three kinds of pharmaceuticals and personal care products (PPCPs), namely erythromycin lactobionate (ETM), diclofenac sodium (DCF), and polyoxyethylene nonylphenol ethers (NPEO₁₀) could significantly decrease the growth rate and inhibit the PSII function of *S. obliquus*. ETM was the most toxic, followed by NPEO₁₀ and DCF. Analysis of the chlorophyll fluorescence rapid response curve revealed that ETM deactivated the PSII reaction center and inhibited the donor and receptor sides of the PSII reaction center. However, the other two PPCPs mainly inhibited the electron transport process after the electron transport chain QA⁻ [54]. Two antibiotics, namely enrofloxacin and erythromycin thiocyanate, inhibited the growth of *M. aeruginosa* and hinder the photosynthesis process of *M. aeruginosa* and the synthesis of soluble proteins [55].

3.3. Influence of organic compounds on the enzyme activity of algae

Previous studies have shown that the effects of surfactants on the density of S. obliquus and POD activity are mainly due to the adsorption of quaternary ammonium salt on the cell's phospholipid bilayer membrane, which causes damage to the membrane structure and loss of function and damage to the chlorophyll and enzyme structure, affecting algae cell photosynthesis and enzyme activity and ultimately leading to cell death [56]. A study of the melamine toxicity of S. obliquus showed that the superoxide dismutase (SOD) activities of S. obliguus were initially stimulated and then inhibited with an increase in melamine concentration, reaching a peak at 200 mg/L and decreasing by 43.6% in 750 mg/L compared with the control group. The contents of malondialdehyde (MDA) and soluble sugar were inhibited significantly under moderate and high concentrations of melamine. The effects of melamine on the lipid peroxidation product MDA of S. obliquus and soluble sugar were consistent and decreased with an increase in melamine concentration [57].

3.4. Influence of organic compounds on the cell structure and chlorophyll content of algae

The plasticizer DBP could reduce the content of chlorophyll a, destroy the cell inclusions, prevent algal cell division, and mainly affect the number of cells and species for natural algae [58]. With an increase in the concentration of polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), the total quantity of Chlorella pyrenoidosa and S. obliquus cells showed a decreasing trend, and the growth of algae was inhibited. A low concentration (<0.4 ng/mL) exerted a minor effect on stimulating growth. At a high concentration (>10 ng/mL), algal cells grew slowly, even for negative growth, and the algae were yellow or colorless. Under a microscope, the chloroplast disintegrated, the cell structure was incomplete, and the percentage of broken cell debris was higher. The growth of algae was completely halted at 50 ng/mL [46]. With increase in the concentration of ionic liquid 1-butyl-3-methlimidazolium chloride ([BMIM]Cl), the inhibition rate of S. obliquus growth increased, leading to a decrease in chlorophyll content. Exposed to 80 mg/L (BMIM) Cl solution, the ultrastructure of S. obliquus cells showed the phenomenon of plasmolysis, chloroplast lamellae rupture, and mitochondrial ridge reduction [59,60].

4. Ecotoxicological effects of artificial nanomaterials on algae

With the development of nanotechnology, nanomaterials gradually start to affect people's lives and increasingly enter into the environment. Because of their unique special physical and chemical properties, nanomaterials pose a threat to the ecological environment and human health [61]. Studies of the environmental effects and biological safety of artificial nanomaterials have focused on nanometer oxides, carbon nanomaterials, and nanocrystalline metals because of the wide range of applications and high risks environmental exposure. Nanomaterials have a certain effect on the growth status, cell structure, photosynthetic pigment content, protein content, and enzyme activity of algae. The harmful effect is also related to the properties, morphology, size, and solubility of nanomaterials [62]. The harmful effect and the analyses and conclusions regarding such materials were displayed in Table 3.

4.1. Nanometer oxide

Research have demonstrated that nano-oxide can inhibit the growth of algae to block the synthesis of photosynthetic pigments and proteins, thereby halting antioxidant enzyme activity and exerting a great impact on the growth and physiology of algae. When exposed to nano-TiO₂, the growth of *S. obliquus* and synthesis of chlorophyll a were promoted at a low concentration (<5 mg/L) of nano-TiO₂. However, such growth and synthesis were inhibited at a high concentration (>10 mg/L) [67]. Nano-TiO₂ has an inhibitory effect on the growth of *Gymnodinium breve* with 72h-EC₅₀ of 9.7 mg/L. The influence of nano-TiO₂ on the oxidation system and free oxygen radicals may be related to its algal inhibition

Table 2 EC_{50} for various organic compounds on algae

Algae species	Organic compounds		EC ₅₀ (mg/L)			References
			48h-EC ₅₀ (mg/L) 72h-EC ₅₀ (mg/L) 96h-EC ₅₀ (mg/L)			
Scenedesmus obliquus	Phenols	Phenol			341	[45]
		o-Chlorophenol			85	[45]
		2,4-Dichloro-			25	[45]
		phenol				
		Pentachlorophe-			1.50	[45]
		nol				
		PCBs			21.62	[46]
		1,2,4-Trichloro-			341	[47]
		benzene				
	Plasticizer	DBP	15.49	1.95	2.21	[48]
	Surfactants	Cetyl trimethyl	1.8	2.4		[23]
		ammonium				
		bromide				
		Linear	142.3	153.3		[23]
		alkylbenzene				
		sulfonates				
		TX-100	171.2	164.7		[23]
	Pesticide	Cypermethrin			45.75;112.45	[49,50]
					(acetone),112.81	
					(ethyl acetate)	
		Methamidophos			12.31	[49]
		Acephate	667.7	523.0		[51]
		Atrazine	0.03	0.022	0.021	[52]
Chlorella sp.	Pesticide	Lambda-cyhalo-			105.71	[53]
		thrin				
		Parathion	3.6	7	6	[24]
		Dichlorvos	15.4	15.8	11.7	[24]
		Methamidophos	76.7	92.3	104.5	[24]
		Dhaving	15	90	57	[24]
		Phoxim	1.5	1.205	1.12	[24]
		Motribuzin	9.3	13.4	0.021	[24]
	Pesticide	Puma super			0.021	[11]
	resticité	Alachlor			5.54	[11]
Chlorella purenoidosa	Phenols	PCBs			7.73	[46]
Microcystis	Drug	Enrofloxacin	0.085			[11]
aeruginosa	U	Erythromycin	0.048			[11]

mechanism [65]. Hollow glass microspheres of coated nano- TiO_2 could inhibit the photosynthesis of cyanobacteria and diatom, thereby showing potential applications of nanomaterials for inhibiting algal overgrowth. Nano-ZnO significantly promoted the growth of *S. obliquus* at a low concentration (5 mg/L) and gradually inhibited growth at an increased concentration. At its highest concentration (50 mg/L), the cytochrome content was reduced and the protein content and antioxidant enzyme activity decreased significantly, causing significant cell oxidative damage [5].

4.2. Nanocrystalline metals

Four nanometal additives, namely Cu, Al, Zn, and Ti, had certain levels of biological toxicity for luminous bacteria, and biotoxicity increased with their addition. In addition, biological toxicity was evidently enhanced by the synergistic effect of metal when combined with a multimetal additive [68]. Two kinds of nano-Cu powders with different grain sizes, inhibited the survival of *S. obliquus, Chlorella ellipsoide,* and *Tetraselmis tetrethele* to different degrees, and the inhibition

Table 3	
Toxicological effects of artificial nanomaterials on al	gae

Nanomaterials	Algae	Effect	Determination index	References
Nano-CeO ₂	Scenedesmus obliquus	Promoted in the low concentration inhibited in the middle concen- tration, obviously inhibited in the high concentration.	Photosynthetic pigment, SOD, MDA	[63]
Nano-TiO ₂	S. obliquus	Promoted in the low concentration, inhibited in the high concentration, SOD activity firstly increased and decreased then, MDA content gradually increased.	Cell density, chlorophyll a, SOD, MDA	[64]
	Gymnodinium breve	72h-EC ₅₀ is 9.7mg/L, SOD activity seriously decreased, CAT activity, hydroxyl radical and hyper anion obviously increased.	SOD, CAT, MDA	[65]
	Chlorella sp.	In the concentration of 0.01–500mg/L, without obvious inhibition.	EC ₅₀	[5]
Nano-NiO ₂	Scenedesmus quadricauda Chlorella sp. Selenastrum capricornutum	The content of chlorophyll a, antioxidant activity and protein decreased, the content of MDA increased, stronger resistance to nano-NiO ₂	Growth status, chlorophyll a, protein, MDA, SOD, CAT	[66]
SWCNTs	Chlorella sp.	Obvious inhibition, its 96h-EC ₅₀ is 261.5mg/L.	EC ₅₀	[5]
CNTs	Chlorella sp.	The toxicities of CNTs in the following order: SWCNTs > short SWCNTs > DWCNTs > short DWCNTs	Photosynthetic pigments, soluble protein, SOD, POD	[67]

of several microalgae of nano-Cu powder was considerably heavier than that of ordinary Cu powder with the same content or even ten or one hundred times as much [69]. A total of 1 mg/L nano-Ag particles significantly inhibited the growth of *M. aeruginosa*, with an inhibition rate of 87% [70]. Fe was a crucial factor in the synthesis of chlorophyll, the effect of nano-Fe on algae was no significant, and the appropriate amount of Fe facilitated the growth of algae.

4.3. Carbon nanomaterials

As representatives of carbon nanomaterials, fullerene, metallofullerene, and carbon nanotubes (CNTs) are playing an increasingly irreplaceable and crucial role in human production and life. They also exert certain ecological impact. CNTs inhibited the growth of *S. obliquus*. First, the harmful effect of CNTs on *S. obliquus* was connected to the number of graphene layers. In particular, single-walled carbon nanotubes (SWCNTs) had higher toxicities than double-walled carbon nanotubes (DWCNTs). The toxicity of CNTs was associated with their length. The long nanotubes were more toxic than the short ones [71]. Research on the harmful effect of three types of multivalent carbon nanotubes (MWCNTs) on *Chlorella* sp. showed that MWCNTs strongly inhibited algae growth under light or dark conditions and their inhibitory

effects were dose dependent. Algal toxicity of MWCNTs was mainly explained by the three major mechanisms of shading effect, physical interaction, and oxidative damage [63].

5. Conclusions and prospects

Typical pollutants such as heavy metals, organic compounds, and artificial nanomaterials had stimulating effects on the growth of algae in the low concentration range, and the growth of algae was in a highly inhibited in the high concentration. The toxic mechanisms of different pollutants of algae are summarized in terms of three aspects: photosynthesis, enzyme activity, and metabolism and cell structure. Heavy metals and organic compounds can inhibit the growth of algae by blocking the synthesis of photosynthetic pigments and membrane permeability, affecting the activity of PSII reaction center or inhibit the electron transport process of photoelectron transfer chain, destroying the structure and function of algal cell membrane and damage the ultrastructure of algal cells thereby halting antioxidant enzyme activity and exerting a great impact on the growth and physiology of alga. Nanomaterials can inhibit the growth of algae by release of a large number of reactive oxygen species on algal cells to produce oxidative stress and inhibit algal cell growth, contacting with the physical damage of algae cells

290

and result in algal cytoplasmic wall separation, cracking, and agglomeration with algal cells, affecting the normal swimming of the cells and their absorption of light energy, nutrients, and gas exchange.

Although previous research has been demonstrated that typical pollutants have certain impact on algae growth, enzyme activity, photosynthesis, cell structure, and metabolism. Further in-depth research work can be carried out from the following aspects with regard to ecotoxicological effects of typical pollutants on algae. For example, there are various indexes, such as algae growth characteristics, chlorophyll fluorescence characteristics, enzyme activity, etc. that can be used for characterization of toxic effect on algae. However, this index system in previous is not systematic enough and a widely accepted testing system, and standard have not been established. Therefore, the establishment of a systematic and standard ecotoxicological testing system is one of the problems to be solved.

In terms of toxicity test method, most previous research only carried out acute toxicity experiments, and few conducted long-term continuous observation of algae toxicity and carried out chronic toxicity experiments. Although algae have the characteristics of fast growth and short growth cycle, whether it can find other test ways and methods for long-term serial chronic toxicity is a direction that can be explored in the future. Single or two of the same pollutants (such as the combined toxic effect of two heavy metals) were often used for investigating ecotoxicological effects of typical pollutants on algae. However, there are many kinds of pollutants in the actual polluted water and ecotoxicological effects are often caused by multiple pollutants. For example, whether there is interaction between nanomaterials and existing pollutants (heavy metals, persistent organic pollutants, etc.) in the water ecosystem, and the extent of such interaction, is of great significance to further research.

Acknowledgments

This research was financially supported by the National Key Research and Development Program (Grant No. 2016YFC0502201); the Special Scientific Research Foundation of Public Welfare Profession of the Ministry of Water Resources, China (Grant No. 201401042); and the special fund for basic scientific research business of central public research institutes (Grant No. CKSF2017026/SH, CKSF2017045+SH, CKSF2016270/SH).

References

- J.C. Chapman, The role of ecotoxicity testing in assessing water quality, Austral Ecol., 20 (2010) 20–27.
 C. Tien, C. Chen, Assessing the toxicity of organophosphorous
- [2] C. Tien, C. Chen, Assessing the toxicity of organophosphorous pesticides to indigenous algae with implication for their ecotoxicological impact to aquatic ecosystems, J. Environ. Sci. Health., Part B, 47 (2012) 901–912.
- [3] S. Das, S.S. Choudhury, Pollution of aquatic ecosystem due to anthropogenic activities: a review, Global J. Pharm. Res., 4 (2016) 391–393.
- [4] F. Perreault, A. Oukarroum, S.P. Melegari, W.G. Matias, R. Popovic, Polymer coating of copper oxide nanoparticles increases nanoparticles uptake and toxicity in the green alga *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*, Chemosphere, 87 (2012) 1388–1394.
- [5] I.M. Šadiq, S. Dalai, N. Chandrasekaran, A. Mukherjee, Ecotoxicity study of titania (TiO₂) NPs on two microalgae

species: *Scenedesmus* sp. and *Chlorella* sp., Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf., 74 (2011) 1180–1187.

- [6] L.P. Wang, B.H. Zheng, W. Meng, Toxicity effects of heavy metal copper on two marine microalgae, Mar. Environ. Sci., 26 (2007) 6–9.
- [7] T.R. Perez, S.S. Sarma, Combined effects of heavy metal (Hg) concentration and algal (*Chlorella vulgaris*) food density on the population growth of *Brachionus calyciflorus* (Rotifera: Brachionidae), J. Environ. Biol., 29 (2008) 139–142.
- [8] Z.S. Lin, L.M. Xing, L. Guo, B. Wan, The influence of 4 kind of heavy metal ions to the growth of *Phaeodactylum tricornutum*, Chin. J. Oceanol. Limnol., 26 (1995) 582–585.
- [9] B. Sun, Effects of chromium(VI) on the growth phytoplankton in sea water, J. Ocean Univ. Qingdao, 4 (1990) 1–8.
- [10] H. Yan, X. Wang, Y. Lin, G. Wen, Toxic effects of Cu, Zn and Mn on the inhibition of *Chlorella pyrenoidosa*'s growth, Acta. Sci. Circumst., 22 (2001) 23–26.
- [11] Z. Yang, B. Dong, J. Wu, Sensitivity of *Chlorella vulgaris* to metribuzin, puma and alachlor, Chin. J. Appl. Ecol., 15 (2004) 1621–1625.
- [12] X.U. Ming, D.U. Chun, Toxic effects of organic tin on *Dicrateria* sp., J. Oceano. Huanghai Bohai Seas., 9 (2011) 66–69.
- [13] X.D. Yu, Toxic Effects of Three Kinds of Heavy Metal Irons on Four Species of Marine Microalgae, Studies Basing on Integrated Biology Ocean University of China, Qingdao, 2012.
- [14] X. He, X. Peng, The influence of lead on marine microalgae by a flow cytometry, Mar. Environ. Sci., 22 (2003) 1–5.
- [15] K. Li, F.Q. Wang, S.X. Sun, Q.U. Wei, L. Zhang, L.I. Qi, Study on endurance capacity of *Monochrysis lutheri* to the toxicity of the heavy metal ions, J. Dalian Univ., 4 (2003) 92–94.
- [16] Y.L. Zhang, Study on Stress Effects of Heavy Metals on Pavlova viridis and its Biosorption Capability, Jinan University, Guangzhou, 2003.
- [17] S. Zhao, H. Sun, Effects of Nitrogen, Phosphorus and Three Heavy Metals on the Growth of *Pavlova viridis*, Zhanjiang Ocean University, Guangzhou, 2005.
- [18] J.W. Rachlin, T.E. Jensen, B. Warkentine, The toxicological response of the alga *Anabaena flos-aquae* (cyanophyceae) to cadmium, Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol., 13 (1984) 143–151.
- [19] Y.U. Yang, K. Qian, the application of flow cytometry in the ecotoxicity studies of copper with microalgae, Environ. Chem., 23 (2004) 525–528.
- [20] M. Edding, F. Tala, Copper transfer and influence on a marine food chain, Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol., 57 (1996) 617–624.
- [21] H. Cheng, S. Pan, Bioremediation potential of spirulina: toxicity and biosorption studies of lead, J. Zhejiang Univ. Sci. B, 6 (2005) 171–174.
- [22] H. Chen, G. Pan, H. Yan, Y. Qin, Toxic effects of hexavalent chromium on the growth of blue-green microalgae, Chin. J. Environ. Sci., 24 (2003) 13–18.
- [23] Q. Shen, B. Wang, B.L. Yang, T.N. Wang, Y. Yang, C.Y. Jiang, S.B. Zhang, Acute toxicity of several surfactants to *Scenedesmus obliquus*, J. Saf. Environ., 11 (2011) 1–3.
- [24] S.U. Dan, P. Tai, L.I. Peijun, K.E. Xin, Toxic effects of lanthanides on *Chlorella autotrophica*, Chin. J. Ecol., 24 (2005) 382–384.
- [25] Y.T. Hao, J.H. Li, X. Pan, Tolerance of *Chlorella ellipsoidea* and its removal of heavy metals, J. Lake Sci., 13 (2001) 158–162.
- [26] K. Li, L. Li, H. Hou, X. Su, Q. Fan, Study on toxicity of heavy metal ions to two species of marine unicellular algae, Chin. J. Appl. Environ. Biol., 8 (2002) 395–398.
- [27] C. Wang, Comparative study on the toxicity of six organophosphorus pesticides and three heavy metal ions to *Chlorella vulgaris*, Henan Sci., 6 (1999) 108–110.
- [28] Z. Wei, Y. Hai, Z. Wu, Toxic effects of copper on inhibition of the growths of unicellular green algae, China Environ. Sci., 21 (2001) 4–7.
- [29] Y.H. Liu, Interaction of *Scenedesmus obliquus* and heavy metals, Hohai University, Nanjing, 2007.
- [30] M. Mobin, N.A. Khan, Photosynthetic activity, pigment composition and antioxidative response of two mustard (*Brassica juncea*) cultivars differing in photosynthetic capacity

subjected to cadmium stress, J. Plant Physiol., 164 (2007) 601–610.

- [31] A. Ventrella, L. Catucci, E. Piletska, S. Piletsky, A. Agostiano, Interactions between heavy metals and photosynthetic materials studied by optical techniques, Bioelectrochemistry, 77 (2009) 19–25.
- [32] R.L. Heath, Inhibition of the photosynthetic capacity of isolated chloroplasts by ozone, Plant Physiol., 53 (1974) 32–38.
 [33] P.A. Rousos, H.C. Harrison, K.L. Steffen, Physiological
- [33] P.A. Rousos, H.C. Harrison, K.L. Steffen, Physiological responses of cabbage to incipient copper toxicity, J. Am. Soc. Hortic. Sci., 114 (1989) 149–152.
- [34] R.L. Heath, Possible mechanisms for the inhibition of photosynthesis by ozone, Photosynth. Res., 39 (1994) 439–451.
- [35] B. Tripathy, P. Mohanty, Zinc-inhibited electron transport of photosynthesis in isolated barley chloroplasts, Plant. Physiol., 66 (1980) 1174–1178.
- [36] I.S. Sheoran, H.R. Singal, R. Singh, Effect of cadmium and nickel on photosynthesis and the enzymes of the photosynthetic carbon reduction cycle in pigeonpea (*Cajanus cajan L.*), Photosynth. Res., 23 (1990) 345–351.
- [37] X.H. Čai, S.J. Traina, T.J. Logan, T. Gustafson, R.T. Sayre, Applications of eukaryotic algae for the removal of heavy metals from water, Mol. Mar. Biol. Biotechnol., 4 (1995) 338–344.
- [38] J.J. Brand, D.W. Becker, Evidence for direct roles of calcium in photosynthesis, J. Bioenerg. Biomembr., 16 (1984) 239–249.
- [39] E.A. Webster, G.M. Gadd, Perturbation of monovalent cation composition in *Ulva lactuca* by cadmium, copper and zinc, Biometals, 9 (1996) 51–56.
- [40] R.L. Klotz, Algal response to copper under riverine conditions, Environ. Pollut., 24 (1981) 1–19.
- [41] B.A. Silverberg, Cadmium-induced ultrastructural changes in mitochondria of freshwater green algae, Phycologia, 15 (1976) 155–159.
- [42] B. Jiang, B. Lin, Effect of nickel on Ankistrodesmus sp. in the physiological and biochemical process – an initial report on studies of the nickels toxicological effects on Ankistrodesmus sp., Environ. Prot., 4 (1995) 24–28.
- [43] M.H. Zhou, X.W. Zhao, X.C. Wu, Inhibition effects of Cu²⁺, Cd²⁺ and Cr(vi) on the growth of *Rhodopseudomonas palustris*, Chin. J. Appl. Environ. Biol., 8 (2002) 290–293.
- [44] B.H. Jiang, B.Q. Lin, Toxicological effects of heavy metals on algae. J. Liaoning Univ., 27 (2000) 281–287.
- [45] H. Yan, toxic effects of phenols on inhibitions of Scenedesmus obliquus' growth, Environ. Chem., 17 (1998) 127–130.
- [46] X. Nie, Č. Lan, L. Lin, M. Huang, The effects of aroclor 1254 on the growth of *Chlorella pyrenoidosa* and *Scenedesmus obliquus*, Acta Sci. Nat. Univ. Sunyatseni, 41 (2002) 68–71.
- [47] D.U. Qing, C.N. Huang, X.S. Jia, Toxic effects and mechanisms of 1,2,4-trichlorobenzene on *Scenedesmus obliquus*, J. Agron. Environ. Sci., 26 (2007) 1375–1379.
- [48] Q.Q. Hu, X. Li, W.Y. Li, Toxic effects of dibutyl phthalate (dbp) on *Scenedesmus obliquus*, Asian. J. Ecotoxicol., 3 (2008) 87–92.
- [49] X.Y. Xu, Y. Wei, H.F. Tang, J.Y. Zhang, S.P. Chen, L. Xiong, Combined toxicity effect of methamiclophos and cypermethrin to *Scenedesmus obliquus*, J. Agron. Environ. Sci., 2 (2007) 54–58.
- [50] L. Xiong, W.U. Zbenbin, Q. Kuang, Y. Xia, H.E. Feng, Studies on the toxicity of cypermethrin to *Scenedesmus obliquus*, Acta Hydrobiol. Sinica, 26 (2002) 66–73.
- [51] M. Chen, G.E. Shun, Y. Song, W. Qiu, Acute and chronic response of *Scenedesmus obliquus* to acephate, J. Nanjing. Univ. Inform. Sci. Technol., 5 (2013) 289–295.
- [52] F.C. Li, Toxicity effects of herbicide atrazine on the population growth of *Scenedesmus obliquus*, J. Anhui Agric. Sci., 36 (2008) 7427–7428.
- [53] Y. Zhang, M. Wang, Y.P. Liu, Y. Yang, Z.H. Huang, H. Wang, X.T. Zhang, The Toxicity of lambda-cyhalothrin on *Chlorella* vulgaris, Agrochemicals, 50 (2011) 125–127.

- [54] X.P. Nie, B.Y. Liu, H.J. Yu, W.Q. Liu, Y.F. Yang, Toxic effects of erythromycin, ciprofloxacin and sulfamethoxazole exposure to the antioxidant system in *Pseudokirchneriella subcapitata*, Environ. Pollut., 172 (2013) 23–32.
- [55] S. Koussevitzky, A. Nott, T.C. Mockler, F. Hong, G. Sachetto-Martins, M. Surpin, J. Lim, R. Mittler, J. Chory, Signals from chloroplasts converge to regulate nuclear gene expression, Science, 316 (2007) 715–9.
- [56] C.Y. Ahn, S.H. Joung, J.W. Jeon, H.S. Kim, B.D. Yoon, H.M. Oh, Selective control of cyanobacteria by surfactin-containing culture broth of *Bacillus subtilis* C1, Biotechnol. Lett., 25 (2003) 1137–1142.
- [57] S.E. Sabatini, A.B. Juarez, M.R. Eppis, L. Bianchi, C.M. Luquet, M.M.C. Rios, Oxidative stress and antioxidant defenses in two green microalgae exposed to copper, Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf., 72 (2009) 1200–1206.
- [58] W.J. Adams, G.R. Biddinger, K.A. Robillard, J.W. Gorsuch, A summary of the acute toxicity of 14 phthalate esters to representative aquatic organisms, Environ. Toxicol. Chem., 14 (1995) 1569–1574.
- [59] L. Duan, D.U. Yao, L.U. Qiu-Lin, W.D. Cai, Z.G. Fang, H.J. Liu, Toxicity of 1-butyl-3-methylimidazolium chloride ionic liquid to *Scenedesmus obliquus*, China. Environ. Sci., 32 (2012) 886–891.
- [60] H. Qian, W. Chen, G.D. Sheng, X. Xu, W. Liu, Z. Fu, Effects of glufosinate on antioxidant enzymes, subcellular structure, and gene expression in the unicellular green alga *Chlorella vulgaris*, Aquat. Toxicol., 88 (2008) 301–307.
- [61] G. Brumfiel, Nanotechnology: a little knowledge, Nature, 424 (2003) 246–248.
- [62] K.L. Dreher, Health and environmental impact of nanotechnology: toxicological assessment of manufactured nanoparticles, Toxicol. Sci., 77 (2004) 3–5.
- [63] M.H. Park, K.H. Kim, H.H. Lee, J.S. Kim, S.J. Hwang, Selective inhibitory potential of silver nanoparticles on the harmful cyanobacterium *Microcystis aeruginosa*, Biotechnol. Lett., 32 (2010) 423–428.
- [64] R. Brayner, R. Ferrariiliou, N. Brivois, S. Djediat, M.F.B F. Fiévet, Toxicological impact studies based on *Escherichia coli* bacteria in ultrafine ZnO nanoparticles colloidal medium, Nano Lett., 6 (2006) 866–870.
- [65] N.J. Rogers, N.M. Franklin, S.C. Apte, G.E. Batley, B.M. Angel, J.R. Lead, M. Baalousha, Physico-chemical behaviour and algal toxicity of nanoparticulate CeO₂ in freshwater, Environ. Chem., 7 (2010) 50–60.
- [66] F.M. Li, W. Zhao, Y.Y. Li, Z.J. Tian, Z.Y. Wang, Toxic effects of nano-TiO2 on *Gymnodinium breve*, Environ. Sci., 33 (2012) 233–238.
- [67] Y. Xiao, C. Hao, Y. Hai, Q. Bo. Effects of Nano-TiO2 and Single-Walled Carbon Nanotubes on the Growth of *Chlorella vulgaris*, Asian J. Ecotoxicol., 5 (2010) 38–43.
- [68] L.Z. Zhu, S.Y. Tian, Y.P. Lang, Y. Li, Aquatic ecotoxicities of nanoscale TiO₂/ZnO and Al₂O₃ water suspensions, Acta Ecol. Sinica, 28 (2008) 3507–3516.
- [69] N. Gong, K.S. Shao, C.H. Liang, Y. Wang, T. Jiang, W. Feng, Y.Q. Sun, Biotoxicity of two-size nickel oxide nanoparticles on *Chlorella vulgaris*, Mar. Environ. Sci., 30 (2011) 457–460.
- [70] Y. Ju, S. Xie, G. Lu, B. Guo, Q. Guan, Research on the application of luminescent bacteria to inspect ecotoxicity of nanometal additives, Lubr. Eng., 3 (2006) 7–12.
- [71] F.U. Feng, Z.Q. Liu, C.H. Chen, Pilot study about effects of Copper nanoparticle on phytoplankton growth, Ecologic. Sci., 26 (2007) 126–130.

292